

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: Um, ya, [Janine], I can't believe it's, it is the second follow-up already.

P7: Gosh. Time does fly.

CH: And, and I think I, I don't know if you want me to come to that third observation, because I know you were disappointed in the first, you know, the first observation that there was one student. So, I don't know if you want me to come to the third and I can use whichever is a preferred one or what?

P7: You know, Chantal, it is up to you. It is tonight, but also...

CH: Okay. I am not going to be able to agree to that one tonight.

P7: Okay. Then, then, then, then don't. You know what, it is just, again, even with this, the national support sessions, we still didn't have people come.

CH: Sjoe.

P7: So again, there was a national support session, um, the end of last week. Nobody came. We had a private referencing workshop. We said, we are going to do another workshop for you. We had two out of 150 students. So, I actually don't think it would be worth it anyway, so ya.

CH: And that is sad because I know that you did have more on your second one than your first one.

P7: Yes, yes.

CH: It wasn't a great number, but still it was, it was more,

P7: Ya.

CH: And, you know, maybe I should start with a question of how does that make you feel? You know, because...

P7: Yes. Um, demoralized.

CH: ...you put a lot in...

P7: It makes you feel demoralized. It makes you feel that you are not able to attract students and then, you know, we all talk about it personally. And particular people, you know, particularly people that you work with, people who are doing the same modules. And, um, so we all kind of take it a little bit personally and then when we rationalize it, we realize that there are other factors that come into play. But it doesn't, you know, you know, Herzberg's theory of motivation? You know, this is, this is an enormous demotivator,

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

enormous demotivator. So, you know, the, the non-engagement in an online space means there is nothing happening. There is nothing happening. You cannot be a radio DJ.

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

P7: That is what we feel like. I could happily go on air now because I am so used to talking to myself. <laugh>

CH: <Laugh>. Ya. And ya, I think the online space has definitely felt it this year just because of circumstances.

P7: Yes, yes.

CH: Um, and, and perhaps when you are answering some of the questions today is don't just let this year, um, be part of your answers because you have been in the online space over the last few years.

P7: Okay.

CH: And perhaps speak a little bit to that because otherwise it, it really is going to give a, a really one-sided view in a particularly difficult year.

P7: Yes. Okay, perfect. Yes.

CH: Um, and so I, I know that we didn't get through all the questions. In fact, there are quite a few questions that we need to, to discuss today. Um, and the focus is going to be on, on really the, the creation of the online learning experiences. So, where you are looking for that engagement, which has been really tough when you just don't have students literally logging on to...

P7: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

CH: ...to support that online learning experience. And there is a question later on where I will ask you, how does it make you feel? And, and we have spoken about demotivation before, but, um, ...

P7: Yes.

CH: ...you spoke, you know, in your, in your previous one. (Now, now let me just refer to it), in your previous one, you spoke to certain skill-sets. So, you spoke to critical thinking, problem-solving, creativity was quite, uh, one that, um, you picked up on through the ICE tasks development and designing an advert for themselves. And then quite an important one was selecting the relevant information. So, becoming the discerning student and what information is applicable, and then how to apply it to their learning experience. And those were, were typically the skill-sets that you referred to, um, ...

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

P7: Yes.

CH: ...in the development of 21st century workplace skills. Um, and then we had started to, to unpack a little bit the graduate, um, attributes to, to collaborate, that creativity. Um, and so the question that I would like to ask you now is how do you support these graduate attributes in your creation of online learning experiences?

P7: In terms of when I said, um, creativity, um? Okay. Um, certainly in the creativity...

CH: And [Janine], I am going to just interrupt you there, that online doesn't mean synchronous, it can also mean asynchronous. Because I think that is an important component in your online space.

P7: Okay. Okay. Um, in terms of those areas, I am trying to take them one by one. The creativity is you support that in allowing students to create elements that are uniquely themselves, like an advert for themselves. Like, um, slogans. So an example, because we are talking about marketing, like tonight we are going through all sorts of different slogans of companies like "OUTsurance, you always get something out" and um, "Savannah, it's dry, but you can drink it." Because then you are trying to teach them, you know, where does this come from? It is not just words. There is actually something behind it. And then we do it with them themselves. If you were going to create your own slogan, what would it be? You know, so that kind of thing. We try and bring out the, the fun side of creativity, trying to get them not to just think about what is, but what could be. Um, in terms of problem-solving and, um, the critical thinking, as I said in our last meeting, one of the things we have tried and, and we, we use it successfully, and again, I am talking over the years now, is that with students in Marketing, we ask them to select companies specifically that they are interested in. And people love things like AB InBev, South African Breweries, Mr. Price. We try and get South African companies, Nando's, what have you. And we use them to say, "Well, what would you do if Nando's was going to do a campaign? What would you choose? So if they have got a, let's say, a new burger and/or something new on the menu, how would you communicate it? Would you use social media? Would you use it, um, advertising? What would you, how would you price it?" So, we would then try and get them to think; not as opposed to saying, "Well, this is what Nando's does", and then kind of marry the two. So that critical thinking and problem-solving is really about trying to use what is in our, what is in our environment for them to start thinking. So those were some examples. I am trying to think what else? Communication, um, you know, that was one of the things we chatted about. Communication, in terms of one of the challenges of the online space, is getting students to speak it. Really, they don't like it, um, because they hear themselves, like, we hear ourselves and you go, you can't believe that that is me. I don't speak like that. So, they are the same<laugh>. And what we have done in the past is just trying so hard to encourage them to speak in the, in the [webinar] sessions. And then what we have found historically is that it does gather momentum if you have got a group. And we sometimes give them a task: "So next time, so-and-so and so-and-so are going to talk, talk about Mr. Price" or, "And so-and-so and so-and-so are going talk about Nando's." So that is one form of communication. The other form of communication is obviously in the

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

assessments: the written communications. And that really is a challenge, I have got to tell you, holy moly! Because there is an enormous disparity of communication skills that we see from people who can actually write a sentence and to people who can't. And we wonder where their matrix came from and how on earth they managed to get into a degree truthfully. So, you know, in terms of communication skill, it is more about the, the assessment and, and the ICE tasks as well. So, um, but just going back to the creativity, the ICE tasks have have been great in Marketing for creativity as well. You know? If, if you had to, we did once, what...you know, create a company...."What would you call it? Why would you call it that? Um, what would be your competitive advantage over your, you know, your competitors" and stuff. So, we try not to go through the theory. We try very, very hard not, or we have tried not to go through the theory. When there is a lack of, um, interaction like we have had this year, it is very difficult.

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

P7: Because we are not working with material that is of relevance to the student. So, but in the past, I have found it very effective. Um, I had a student that worked for Albany bread. My word, we all learned about Albany bread, you know. So, it is just about, especially in the online space, these students are working. They are in the real world. They are talking about real issues in sales and marketing and, and they are asking relevant questions about how marketing is linked to finance and the challenges. And so, it is very different to, um, sort of like a, a face-to-face learning experience. So, I think that, to answer your question in, in entirety, I would say that part of developing these, these skills is about getting them to think for themselves and, um, creating opportunities to problem-solve, if that makes sense. Does that make sense?

CH: It does make sense. And [Janine], um, just with regards to the synchronous versus the asynchronous, the type of activities that you are speaking to for creativity, problem-solving, communication, and the, like, the, the assessments as well, um, are those built, is it a combination of synchronous and asynchronous? Or do you, you use that as a tool in, in, um, your synchronous sessions? You know, like where, where do they really get a chance to, to think and problem-solve? Or is it a combination?

P7: I think it, it is a combination. Uh, I am trying to, ya, I think it would have to be a combination. The, um, the assessments are really important and one of the major changes this year, and was it, was it last year? Is that there are more assessments in the online space. Um, and that has been a good thing. Not for the marking of course, but for the actual development of skills. And, um, so ya, I, I would say it would have to be a combination.

CH: Okay. And, and leading then to, to the next one, which is really about, um, the design element. When creating these online learning experiences, what do you consider as important design elements in the development of 21st century graduate attributes? So, things that you think are critical in allowing the students to engage, um, in these various activities. Like are there specific things that you think must be built in? If you had to give advice to someone, what would you consider building in to support them?

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

P7: Um, I am trying to think. And, and I might not be answering it correctly, so just let me know. But I think that just having [webinar] sessions is, is not sufficient in the online space. It has to be drip-feeding of different bits of information. So, you are building different permutations. It is not just every five weeks or however... Not five weeks. Well, it depends. You know, you can, you can have a session whenever you want or not want or whatever. But it is about a building block of we are going to talk about communication, um, but I am going to send you something beforehand to read. Then we are going to, um, look at a video for two minutes online and then we are going to discuss it. So, it is not just a one, um, a kind of like a one, I am trying to think of the way to describe it. But it is different ways of engagement, if you know what I mean? And that's, that is what has gone out the window this year. It's gone, it's, it has just gone out the window because half the students didn't even have access to [the institution's online platform.]

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

P7: They are not even picking up on the announcements. They are not even reading what we are putting in, you know, we would say, "Read this article, we are going to marry it to, um, this particular learning unit." We haven't even done that this year because it is not, you get into your session and nobody is even, it is just not there. So...

CH: You are just grateful there are students <laugh>. That there is one there. <Laugh>, Forget the work. <laugh>.

P7: Yes. And they do not even know what we are doing. They just sometimes just there to ask questions. You know, it's just, it is... So, I think, what you are asking was that it's just, it is drip feeding along the way. Constant. So, you know, one of the things that also used to happen, not so much again, um, particularly this semester, is we used to try and connect at least twice a week or three times a week outside the [webinars]. By sending some form of added value: a video, an article. "Hey, did you hear this? Look at the social media link. Um, did you know that Nando's has done this? Have you seen this advert of Coca-Cola?" You know, just, or put it, ya, just trying to stimulate some form of interest. Um, and Marketing is easy to do that. It really is. It is very easy. Very difficult if it is Accounting. I mean, crikey, the, the challenge... Or the challenge for Marketing versus Accounting now is that students are going to Accounting because they are finding it really difficult. So, they go to the lectures. Marketing and they go, "Oh, I am sure it will be fine."

CH: And, and so let, if I just, like listening to the way you are speaking and the scaffolding or the building blocks that you have spoken to in the drip theme, part of that was also giving them a sense of direction because you spoke to...

P7: Yes,

CH: ...this is what we are going to do first, then you are going to do this.

P7: Yes.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: So, would you say that clear communication, um, in the asynchronous space is, is quite important?

P7: Yes. Very. And so, what, if you go and have a look at my communications on announcements, I always say, "This week...Hi guys, this week, I would like you to cover this theory" and try and give them, you know, that how do you eat the elephant in bite-size chunks, because that is what online students feel. They feel this, "Oh my word, it's so much. I am never going to get through it. And..." And all the theory and what you learn, um, is that, that, you know, the scaffolding (bit by bit-by-bit) so that they just have little bits. And that has been successful in the past where students actually have done the work. But I cannot say that for this semester particularly. I don't know anybody that has done any work along the way.

CH: Ya. So, I, I think we will keep it more to your years of online and not necessarily this one, because this one is definitely going to skew things in a particular direction. And so, if you look at the communication and announcements, would you say that you, that you feel consistency then? Could you, you are talking about this week- that consistency of the messaging becomes important?

P7: Yes. Very much so. So, my, my plan, every Monday morning, I sit down and that is the first thing I do. I send announcements to, um, my online groups. "Hello. This week", or "Ah, you have got a week off because your assignment is coming." Or, you know, and we try and have a routine, build in a routine because we have learned through going on online courses and whatever, we know that, um, routine is important when you are trying to squeeze in learning in, into a full-time life, job, family, you know. So definitely constant communication and that, that routine built in.

CH: Okay. So, so that sense of routine and familiarity are definitely important?

P7: Yes. Yes. And I have had students in the past that have really lived by it. I have been really surprised; you know. "Oh, you know," they will say, "ooh, we haven't, what is happening this week, [Janine]. We, we haven't had our announcement." I am like, "Oh gosh, it is only nine o'clock. You know, give me a chance." Because they are now, they are wanting that. It's, it's a little bit, um, it is a little bit, um, what is the word? Spoon-feeding? Well, not really. It is just giving them structure. It is like saying, "Okay, it's bite size, you know?" Um, and it is...

CH: Would you say spoon-feeding [Janine]? Because spoon-feeding is telling them what to do.

P7: Ya, maybe not. It is not the right word.

CH: Is it not reassurance? Like...

P7: Maybe, maybe it yes.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: It's, like I am here with you. You are not alone. It's kind of...

P7: Yes. Well, that is the essence of online learning, you know, that flying solo. So, they have to realize that they are not alone, which is the whole essence behind the PST role.

CH: Mm-hmmm <affirmative>.

P7: And that turned upside down on its head this year as well. That, that role is blown so far out the water now because it has now been married with registration and admin. And that is the worst thing that could ever have happened. The PST role was the support: and you are not alone, and I am holding your hand, and you will get through this, and let's have a, let's put together a study plan for you, and tell me about your life. Let's see what we can do... To now, you know, doing registration and oh my word, it's just been a stuff up. That, that, that PST role will never be the same again. So, but it is, it is reassurance. That is what online students need. And not only from the non-academic, so that, let me hold your hand. But also, from the academic, that you can, you know, contact your lecturer. We try to have, you know, within 24 hours in the week and over the weekend, 48, you know, whatever. So...

CH: And just going back to your bringing in the students to engage with you two to three times outside of the [webinar] sessions, did you, just based on previous years, did you, did the students do it? Like, did, did they share? Like, um, were they contributing? Or was it just you putting it out there? Um, was, was there almost like, uh, a sense of we are together in this?

P7: At times? Not consistently, but you got some, you got pockets of students. And I have to tell you, they were mainly mature students. So, these kids coming out of school, going straight into online just doesn't work. And we knew that years ago because the stats told us that. And now of course we don't care because [this institution] just wants to, you know, get the numbers. But statistically the, the students that engage properly and add, um, are the ones that are with a little bit more maturity. Um, so to answer your question, pockets of students, but say out of a, out of a group of 45 to 50 students, maybe 10?

CH: Okay. So definitely a pocket full.

P7: Yes. That's like a 20%, you know, it's, ya. Ya. So definitely not. You, you are seeing, and, and that is throughout the years, so it's not, it's, it is not like an online, I mean, a face-to-face where everybody is engaged. Well, you hope so. No, it, it has never worked like that.

CH: And do you feel that the other students, um, participate but will work rather independently or...?

P7: Yes. Yes.

CH: Okay.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

P7: Definitely. We, so also trend-wise, we have seen also, you know, COVID blew us out the water, various things blew us out the water, and, um, our whole systems-thing blew us out the water. Sorry about the dog. Um,

CH: No problem.

P7: But I have lost my train of thought. Sorry. <laugh>, I am trying to smack the dog. <laugh>. What were we talking about?

CH: We were talking about, um, that the students that they have worked independently. So it wasn't necessarily that they had disengaged. There was, there was still some sort of...

P7: Yes. Yes, we saw a trend as well with the various challenges in life. Oh, the other one, of course, load-shedding. Load-shedding is such a biggie. You know, that was the other challenge that caused students to not have that continuous engagement. But certainly, in dealing with students, a lot of, especially the mature students who are 30 and 40 and 50, are... They are working throughout the whole week and then they spend Sunday, and they go through the collabs and they go through the communication and stuff, you know, so their whole structure of life changed as well. But I forgot about load-shedding because that is a huge one! And, um, you never, certainly with the mature students, they don't use it as an excuse. But the young students obviously, you know, "Oh, I can't. I am load-shedding!" So, but that was another online challenge. And, um,

CH: And, and the problem with the online space is, you know, on campus we are dealing with eThekwin and, and we are very blessed. Um, it is the one time I have been happy for floods <laugh>.

P7: Ya. Ya. <laugh>

CH: And may they never repair the structures- those poor people just because we are not getting that load-shedding.

P7: Yes. Ya.

CH: But in the online space, you have got people from Pretoria and Cape Town and all over the space, all over the place.

P7: Exactly. So, I will get WhatsApp prior to sessions and say, "I am sorry, but there is load-shedding." And I don't even know where they are. So how do I even know, you know? I don't know where students are. You know? Unless you have got that pocket of students that I have had in the past where you get to know them, you have got a sense of community and you know that so-and-so lives in Pretoria and so-and-so lives in wilderness and you have chatted about their jobs and you are trying to bring in their, their work experience and stuff. Otherwise, I haven't a clue where anybody is because it is irrelevant. It should be irrelevant. But it isn't really irrelevant when there is load-shedding.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: Ya.

P7: So that really has been interesting, adding, adding to the, the challenges.

CH: Complexity and the challenges. And then [Janine], you mentioned, um, that there has been an increase of assessments. So, so what, um, the online space has done is they have built in assessments. Have you found with the assessments that turnaround time for feedback, um, is critical in a design element? Um, or any comments with regards to the development of writing skills? Um, ...

P7: Yes.

CH: ...that you, you have referred to in the communication?

P7: Yes. This is actually one of the biggest problems, in my opinion, is that turnaround time. So, to give you an example, so my two Marketing modules, we have gone from one assignment to two assignments. And that is a very important thing in Marketing because from assignment one to assignment two, you have got an opportunity to correct the most amazing things. You have got referencing, which is, I still can't believe how bad it is. And you have got writing skills. You have got essay writing skills. You have got being able to apply theory. And so that turnaround time is absolutely, I would say, essential to be able to give that feedback for assignment two. Whereas in the past we never had that. It was as though you went straight onto the exam. So that is why I think having more than one assessment is so important. What has happened this semester and this year is that the online tutors are not doing that. So, to give you an example is that my colleague in this particular, the Marketing one, has not even marked assignment one yet. And we have done assignment two.

CH: Sjoe <affirmative>. And, and just commenting on maybe, um, feedback from them. Do the students still submit the assessments? Or do, do we see a drop in, in students then submitting their second assessment? Is, have you seen any trends in that?

P7: I haven't seen that. No, no, no. I haven't seen a drop actually at all. Where you find it certainly from a trend perspective is a student will start and before the first assignment they will drop.

CH: Okay.

P7: More so. So ya, they will drop before the first assignment.

CH: Okay. Just obviously they are not getting that opportunity to develop the skill-set that is required between first and second.

P7: Yes. Or what happens from a life and practicality perspective is they have taken on too many modules and they can't cope, and they go, "Right, I am going to have to eliminate. I am not going to do this one. I am just going to focus on that one." And this is

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

why we try so hard to say to students, "Please don't take, you know, three at the outside, but if you have got time, spin it out a bit, you know. Because that is what they find. They find that the load is too much. And in, in a course like Marketing, there is a lot of reading and a lot of assessments. So that has been a bigger, um, you know, you, you look for the first assignment and I can, and I have done both assignments now for both my modules this semester and there has not been a drop off between the two assignments. Ya.

CH: Okay. And then, um, not necessarily referring to, to your, your sessions where there are very few students, because I do know that the challenge engaging students in that online, um, space is quite difficult. But generally, what techniques or strategies do you use to encourage students to, to engage? And I know you have used the chat function because I saw the chat function as being an area where we were...

P7: You mean...Yes. You mean the technical things to engage?

CH: Well, how do you, how do you get students to engage, you know in the, the...

P7: If in the [webinar]?

CH: ...Are there techniques that perhaps we can share with others?

P7: Well, I have used the group thing a couple of times, you know, getting off into groups. But you have got to be very careful with that in the online space. Um, and you have got to do it very, very quickly. Students just don't have the time, if you know what I mean. The, the engagement as a group is more important than the splitting. So, we've, I have used that. Um, but I think in the, in the actual sessions themselves, it is about asking questions, um, using their own examples. So going back to, let's use the company that you work for or you chose that brand. Let's talk about Nike. Um, it is trying to stimulate an interest and asking students questions. So, um, you know, you will look on the, and they don't like this, but if you have got a decent rapport with them and it is built, you know, you have built a community, you will then say, "Okay, Chantal, what do you think about that?" And then, you know, it sort of puts a student a little bit initially and then they will engage. So you are, you know, it's not, you are trying not to make a [boring] experience for them, or you will put something up and then discuss it. You know, what do you think about this? What do you think about that? Um, so those are really the strategies. Um, in terms of engagement.

CH: And in the asynchronous space. So on your [online platform] where, where they are connecting, are there any techniques that you use to try and encourage engagement from them in that space?

P7: Um, look using the technology, I would say journals and discussion boards. Um, the discussion board works quite well. We use that generally a lot in ICE tasks because part of the ICE task is they have to comment at least twice on somebody else's, and they then, they are getting, you know, different perspectives. And then we will start a session with the discussion board if there are enough students, you know.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: And, and just with, with those discussion boards, do you find that they are very superficial type of comments? Or do you find that students start to, um, truly engage with the comments?

P7: Well, I have found, and quite surprisingly is that they generally do engage, I think because it's a bit of a, it is a bit of a pain, you know, and they have to do the work, so I think they get into it and it has always been a surprise to me, to be honest. But, um, you do obviously get your superficial comments and you know, your students who are trying to get an education without doing any work and you know, just go painting, you know, going through the motions. But I have generally found is that there is some substance, particularly the discussion boards. Ya. I don't, you know, journals are, well that's not interactive, but, um, I don't use a lot of the, the other functions.

CH: Okay. And then, um, it lends itself to the choice of technology and tools that you are using. So, you have just spoken to journals and discussion boards, um, in an asynchronous space. Um, how do you select your technologies when creating these online learning experiences to support the development of 21st century graduate attributes? Like if in the, online, in, in the synchronous sessions, are there maybe, um, tools that you like to incorporate such as YouTube or...

P7: Yes.

CH: ...um, like what type of things do you like to include?

P7: Well YouTube is actually a big one, particularly in marketing, again, because we, and all of us, and I say we, because we try and use the same techniques, um, because we use it for the visual stuff in marketing. Or we will use, and, and actually this is now we are talking about synch, ya, synchronous...So we will show a clip of something. Um, but we also will then out of the session, say, "There is a link go and have a look at that." Um, so definitely YouTube, um, bringing up different social medias: Twitter, Facebook, um, Instagram is more difficult. Um, and it depends again, on, on who your students are. Because if you look at people who use different types of social media, um, they are very different. You know, you and I are Facebook users, and the youngsters wouldn't go near. You know, they are Instagram. You try constantly to find out what works for your, for your community. And, and the important thing, and this is what we have lacked so much this year, is building that community and understanding your students. So, um, also part of marketing, um, one of the things we do as well is not only to create an advert, but to like, tell me about yourself. You know, write a little bit- part of your ICE task one, this is me. Who do you work for blah blah, to try and get an understanding into the students. Um, you know, who are you actually dealing with? Um, and trying...

CH: And [Janine], do you allow students to use their choice of technology and provide that, or is it just like a written type of activity? Just out of curiosity?

P7: Just what, what do you mean? I don't quite understand.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: So, where you ask them to maybe, um, so, so the advert would be specific to, to how you would want an advert, but, but have you ever used, um, an opportunity for students to choose their platform and how they want to...?

P7: All the time. They can, they, you know, there's, it is why the ICE tasks are so good, because they can, you know, if they want to, um, submit, you know, things like Prezi and, um, all of that are... Tend to be a lot out of reach for certainly the students that I have come across. You know, we, we tend to stick to the Word and the PowerPoint and the Canvas and, um, but yes, no, they, they don't really prescribe a lot in marketing in terms of how they can submit it. But it does seem to be fairly standard.

CH: And then when using these, um, technologies such as YouTube, so, so for the YouTube, it, it's almost like additional resources. Um, what is your aim in the development of that particular activity? So, you provide them with YouTube, is it just so they have got a better understanding so it is independent research? Or is it in preparation to come to class to be able to engage? Like what, what is the intention by including these different technologies?

P7: Often it is through to develop their, um, critical thinking. You know, what is going on behind what you have shown? Particularly again, if you are looking at some form of marketing communication. What are they trying to do? You know, everybody says, "Oh, but that looks nice and that and what," whatever. But what is it? So that would then form part of the discussion. Um, so critical thinking would be one of the things that you are trying to, um, achieve there, not just additional resource.

CH: Okay.

P7: Um, adverts and, um, strategies of companies, you know, like Nando is going into the UK and the structure of their, their, you know... Here in South Africa, it is a takeaway and the UK, it is a proper restaurant and why? And different target markets. And you know, so you would show them that and then try and have some sort of analysis of, of what is actually happening.

CH: Okay. And are there preferred, preferred technologies that you like? I know YouTube is one that is potentially one for Marketing that is appropriate.

P7: Yes. Yes. Um, ya. Yes. I mean it is. But I am trying to think of, of others, you know, we, ya, no, it...

CH: Not really?

P7: ...it is preferred. Not really. No. No.

CH: Okay. And then we have spoken about challenges. I know that the demotivating one we spoke, I think, quite at length in the first, um, follow-up was some of the challenges you have experienced was how demotivating it has been through the lack of engagement.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

Um, you have spoken about load-shedding, um, and, and that impacting and the fact that the working individual may not actually join those [webinar] sessions because their preference is to access it outside the particular time and, and work through it independently. Um, are there any other challenges that you would like to share? Or, or does that sum it up?

P7: Um, hmm. Certainly, for me, and, and again, um, no, it is not even specific to this year, uh, the lack of development in, um, in online tutoring. So, lack of support to supporting the students engagement, um, strategies, um, communication strategies. You know, we kind of, we talk about the students flying solo. We are also flying solo. Um, although I am lucky, I have very good relationships with the other marketing lecturers. So we collaborate. We, we definitely collaborate. So, I would say that is one, but, uh, ya, I think that the general, um, the, the admin issues have been a huge challenge this year. Really huge, huge, huge challenge. But...

CH: And, and let's take away this year and refer to last year. Do you feel that, um, there is a commitment to the development of online tutoring or something that the online space needs to consider more carefully?

P7: I think that they need to consider it more carefully. Ya. Uh, I feel you, it is growing quite, quite quickly and certainly I have worked with online tutors that "Good luck, there we go." You know? And, um, I feel that more development, not only for new people, but for old people. You know, let's try this, let's do that. Let's work together more- team.

CH: More sharing what works and that.

P7: Yes. What works and what doesn't work is, to me, is really important. And particularly this year, but not, uh, it has been in the past too, feel completely isolated. Ya.

CH: And so, a recommendation potentially from your side, just from your collaboration with others, is the importance of networking with others...

P7: Totally.

CH: ...um, similar online tutors in the field so that...

P7: Yes. Yes.

CH: ...you can share best practice?

P7: Definitely. Definitely. Um, and because of the other challenges that happen, you don't have the time, you just don't have the time to, to share that best practice. Or it hasn't been built into our structures, if you know what I mean?

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

P7: Um, I really believe that there has to be more built in for the student in terms of, they have to understand referencing, they have to be made to do that. And the same with online tutors. We have to engage, we have to share good, bad, and ugly. What works, what doesn't work. We must be made to do that. But, you know, independent contractors, can you do that? I don't know. I don't know if you can do that. Ya.

CH: Um, and then, you know, with the load-shedding, for other students, um, and maybe not, not focus specifically on this year with the systems issue-so if we were looking at a more normal year- and load-shedding hit, um, how do you deal with those challenges? You know, how do you assist students who have got issues such as load-shedding or maybe even data or, or things like that?

P7: Um, well just fortunate that everything is recorded. You know, so we constantly emphasize the recording and the, "So listen to it in your own time. Email me if any problems." You know, that is really all you can do. And it's also, you can't even have a plan A and then do a follow-up session because there is somebody else that is going to be out of sync around the country, you know? So, what I have found, actually a lot more so now, is that students email you privately and ask questions, which actually creates work for the online tutor. You know, it's, and it is the balance. That balance is difficult to get between, "My goodness. I said that in the last [webinar] and in the national support session, and you are asking me again" and I try not to get irritated, you know. Um, but that is really, certainly from the load-shedding perspective, um, that is all we can really do. Certainly, all that I have done was say, "Listen to the recordings." Um, "Can give you...you can email me if you don't understand anything." Um, but most students do not have converters at home. They do not have converters. Um, or what now, what are the students going to do?

CH: And I take it that you do have a converter?

P7: Yes.

CH: Inverter!

P7: Yes.

CH: Inverter. You see, I am terrible. <laugh>.

P7: Yes, we do have one. I mean, we bought it years ago for this reason. So yes, I have an inverter, so I am never offline. Well, and actually I say that the inverter needed servicing, so that was a problem, but Ya. But most people don't have inverters.

CH: Ya. Ya.

P7: You know, and, and all that it powers our Wi-Fi, the TV and one light. That is, it, you know, in the house. But I felt it was important being an online tutor to have that. But students do not have that. They, generally, do not.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: And, and [Janine], what has been your experience in the implementation of these online learning experiences? And let's not look at this year.

P7: Okay.

CH: What generally has been your experience in the implementation of these online learning experiences?

P7: Well, I think certainly over the years, I think that it has been quite positive. Um, as I say, this pocket of students, um, generally have enjoyed, you know, this drip, drip, drip, drip, getting involved in like a business, you know, a particular brand or a particular company or, um, and I think that there, there have been some wins. Certainly, some wins. Um, where I think there have been problems in implementation, have been in writing skills, in referencing is just terrifying. Um, but I think that I don't...I have no other experience other than [this institution]. You do, because you were online, um, you know. You did online learning. Um, but I actually think we are really communicative, and there, and trying to engage with our students. So, I do believe that that constant communication and, um, reassurance works. I really do.

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>. Okay. And then, um, so you've, we have spoken about skill-sets that, that undergraduates should have. In your opinion, are undergraduates ready to develop the skill-sets that you have spoken to? The creativity, problem-solving, critical thinking?

P7: No, I don't think so. I think there is such a disparity of skill. I think. I mean, some of, some of the, and because Marketing is a written, it is written, so you know that you are asked to describe or discuss or explain or apply. And it has been terrifying to see the difference in skills coming through. And I just wonder how, how students have got a matric sometimes. I really believe that...

CH: What do you believe should be done?

P7: ...language...I don't think that we are recruiting correctly. I think that we are just looking to make money and that the students actually are not of a tertiary level, personally.

CH: So, you would be looking for better entrance requirements...?

P7: Yes.

CH: ...into the online?

P7: Yes. Um, more stringent entrance requirements. And, and bearing in mind in South Africa too, because we are 11 official languages, you know, that has its complexity itself. So, there are a lot of students who are not learning in their first language. And that is a challenge. But I am talking more than that. I am talking about students who do not understand the word, "explain", who don't, who don't start a sentence with a capital letter

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

or finish with a full stop. Is that, where did they finish school? This is not a tertiary level at all. And then it says...

CH: So almost that the responsibility lies with the schooling system and upping their standards as well?

P7: Or I don't know...Or it is our responsibility to say that these students are go...and we are able to train them to come out with those graduate skills. Because sometimes you think, "I can't, sjoe!" It is like taking, um, a ten-year old and putting them in a Springbok rugby team. It is too wide. The gap is too wide. There isn't the most sophisticated education in the world that is going to take somebody from one level to another level. And then what are we doing? Are we now producing students who do, are not, um- what's the word? - they're not of that level.

CH: Okay.

P7: So that is my problem.

CH: And have you created any activities to develop some of these skill-sets that are missing?

P7: The skills? Certainly, because Marketing is a writing subject. So, if you go and have a look at, I mean, I am trying to think of some of the ICE tasks this semester, because we change them all the time, the ICE tasks. And a lot of them are written, so, you know, we will give them something. Sometimes we will use an activity on [the Learning Management System]. And, but they are mainly, they are mainly written. So yes, you know, we are trying to look for these, the communication skill, the, um, application, the, you know, if you can't communicate, you can't critically apply. That is the reality of the situation. You know, critical thinking requires communication.

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

P7: So yes, they are, we do, um, a lot of the Marketing activities are designed to write, apply, analyze, you know. We don't say, "What are the five factors of this?" Because that is not what, that is not what the assessments are all about. Everything is about trying to apply it to a case study.

CH: Okay.

P7: So,

CH: Okay. So final questions, <laugh>, and I realize timelines, I hope you have got five additional minutes or if you really pressurized, I understand...

P7: Yes, absolutely.

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: Okay. So, so one of the things in the Teaching and Learning Strategy document, it speaks to supporting the development of the collaborative problem-solver. That is one of our graduate attributes...

P7: Okay.

CH: ...I suppose, promises. Um...

P7: Okay. And what does that exactly mean? What does that mean?

CH: That, that is what I am asking? Yes. What, what is your idea of collaborative learning?

P7: Well, my understanding, when I am thinking of it from a student perspective, I am thinking of it from students who work together to resolve a task or an assignment or, um, ya, that is certainly what, when I think of collaboration, to me that is about working together. What I have seen, however, is that group work in the online space is nothing short of a disaster because the students don't know each other. They are on different timeframes. It is, sjoie, you know, unless you in [the webinar] sessions, like that is where they can engage, elsewhere it is a problem. But so that would be my understanding of collaborative. Is that correct? I mean, what, what is the [institution's] definition of that?

CH: Well, that, that is what the, the study is trying to find out.

P7: Oh. Okay. Oh yes.

CH: So there is no right or wrong. I'm, I am asking your opinion on collaborative learning. Um...

P7: You know, to me, its engagement. It is engagement with others. It is engagement in a, whether it is a [webinar session] like this, where there is a discussion forum. Um, because certainly my experience is that students learn from each other. And, you know, that is part of, it is part of the skill-set actually that you need in the working world is team, you know. The teamwork, the collaborative teams are now essentially the structures of business.

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

P7: So if you can't collaborate... I have got one student this year in Honours, she cannot collaborate. Yoh, she is going to have a problem dealing with people going forward. But so that would be my understanding of collaborative learning: is working, um, to achieve a task and using not just your, your, um, what do you call it, not your teachers, your facilitators of learning, but everybody around you kind-of-thing.

CH: And, and have you used collaboration? So in your [webinar], so in your [webinar] sessions, you have had discussions and that, but have you assigned particular group activities where they have worked on something?

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

P7: Um, successfully? No, other than discussion boards. And, um, and only in a, in a discussion online, because we are finding that students just don't, you know, unless they have relationships within the group, um, it is very much a- you are out for yourself- and you are on different agendas and different times and different jobs. And it is not like, uh, in a classroom. There is no, there is no common denominator with students. There is no, you know, this one- one will be working 12 hours a day and then work on the weekends, and one will be, have a half-day job and work in the afternoons. And it is such a challenge to get that true collaborative learning. Um, I have just had a disaster in my second year of Marketing where its tasks in groups. And now this one said that that person didn't do any work. And that person, now they have gone. We have gone, had to go the contravention route and now they are both getting zero. It is just a disaster. So...Ya.

CH: Ya, I think that, ya, that is the challenge with, with group work. Um, and probably more difficult in an online space than face-to-face. And then...

P7: Much more difficult.

CH: ... the last, the last part is just looking at the problem-solving area. So what elements, so from a design perspective, what elements do you consider when creating problem-solving tasks in the online space? Are there specifics...

P7: When you say design, when you, what do you actually mean that?

CH: So when you are creating an activity that requires them to problem-solve, are there specific things that you try to build in to assist them with the problem-solving activity? Are there certain things that you consider important for that particular problem-solving activity?

P7: I am trying to think. Not, um, not really. Other than that, the outcomes of the problem-solving activity must reflect that the student has been able to understand and apply the, whatever the issue is. They are so different. Um,

CH: Ya, I think that's an important component.

P7: Ya.

CH: That the outcomes of the activity kind of define...

P7: Yes, yes. You know, we talk...

CH: ...how you go about it.

P7: about problem-solving. But you know, have they really done that? Or are they just kind of, just providing something? And um, again, I think in the marketing realm, it is very much an application base. So...

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

CH: You have just answered the final, final question. <laugh>.

P7: ...Oh <laugh>. Which is? Can you elaborate...

CH: What tasks do you give that are problem-solving? And you have just gone application-based <laugh>.

P7: Application. Application. Look at this company, look at this, look at that product. What is it? How does it work? What, what marketing strategy? Um, what is its comp? How would you, what is it? Why is it unique? Um, it has, it has to be applied because otherwise the theory is meaningless. It's just meaningless. So, and marketing's easy to do that.

CH: So [Janine], I mean, I really want to thank you for taking the time...

P7: Oh, you are very welcome.

CH: ...to sit with me to answer a whole lot of questions. Um, is there anything...?

P7: I am sorry that I did not...I am sorry that I had no substance to the [webinars]. I mean, I am really sorry about that.

CH: No. No. You did have substance. It's just not how you would, I know...

P7: Yes.

CH: ...what you would have liked me to observe.

P7: Yes.

CH: But but it has given the context of this year.

P7: Ya.

CH: Um, and, and I think the opportunity to, to discuss your experience of, of over the years is absolutely crucial. And unpacking, you know, what has been the lived experience this year to your previous experiences in the online space.

P7: Yes. Okay.

CH: And is there anything that you feel you need to add at this point that you didn't have a chance? Because I kept interrupting you or something where you wanted to, to add to the discussion on, you know, how do we create these online learning experiences to support the development of 21st century graduate attributes?

P7: I think one of the things that would add, in my opinion, to graduates is the linking of modules. You know, students are so incredibly siloed. Oh, that is Marketing. Oh, that is

Follow-up Meeting 2 with Participant 7

Accounting. Oh, that is Economics. But I try and explain to students that Marketing is the baby of Economics and Psychology. And you know, the linking has to happen somewhere along the line. So, to me, that would be a really positive, um, way of developing these 21st century graduate skills and attributes that you are talking about, um, is to say, well, how does Marketing work with Finance and Economics? And because the world doesn't work in the silo and um, why can't we have assessments that cover everything? To me, that is a much better way of assessing, you know, that critical thinking. But how you do that, of course, I don't know. You know.

CH: I just think it is interesting because <laugh>, yesterday's e-symposium was multi-disciplinary approaches. I don't know if you had a chance to join, but ya, that was definitely a theme that is coming through, whether we see it...

P7: Oh, Oh no. I mean, I do it with my Honour students anyway, you know. The two different modules that they do in each semester], I go, "Right, what is happening in the other one? Come let's link." Because how- you can't learn that. And you can't just learn that. And then there is no application again in the real world. And it is so interesting. My sister-in-law who lives in Australia was telling me they are doing away with all exams in Australian schools. Can you believe it? They are moving away. She works in a school. She is actually the marketing manager. And she is saying they are moving away, and they are also moving towards application-based, you know, case study, case study, case study. And to me, it would be beneficial to give an online student a case study and then ask Marketing questions and Economics questions and Accounting questions so that you bring it all together...

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>.

P7: ...instead of these silos that we tend to talk about. Because Marketing people say this, and Accounting people say that, and it doesn't work like that. But it was just interesting to me in Australia that exams per se, are being phased out and how, ya, this, this application-based case study problem-solving, they are starting to learn now when they are 10 and they are 11 and 12 and ya. So, we don't need, need to...

CH: I love the suggestion; I love the suggestion on multidisciplinary approaches. [Janine], thank you so much.

P7: Such a pleasure. I hope it's; it has added to your study.