

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

CH: Okay, I'm starting.

P4: You know what, um, actually all the questions that you have given to me are wonderfully kept in my pigeonhole at work and I am not at work <laugh>.

CH: That's okay. Um, I have got the set of questions here and I'm not going to work through all the questions today. Um, based on the discussion, I won't go over an hour, so, so.

P4: That's fine.

CH: I know the value of time. Um, so in the second follow-up session, you'll see that I will follow with certain questions, so the ones we haven't covered, and then I'll revisit one or two just to unpack it a little bit.

P4: Okay, that's fine.

CH: And also, one thing that I haven't done is I haven't looked at how you've set things up on [the institution's online platform]. I've enrolled in your [online] module just because I was in the admin and setting up all the modules. But I actually haven't gone to look and I've purposely done that because in this discussion I'm interested in, um, how you've created your online experience. And it's not necessarily both synchronous, it's not necessarily just focused on the online lecture, but it can also be in an asynchronous manner. So, I'll then go and have a look

P4: What, what I might, I don't know if, if this, okay...so herein lies the problem. This particular module, the, the, the two online that you have witnessed is actually the module I've taken over from [Justine].

CH: Okay.

P4: So, I don't know if that [online platform] experience is going to be half her half me. So, I don't know if you want another module just to see how I do things on [the institution's online platform] that has been all me?

CH: Okay. Maybe that's a good thing. Maybe just share that module with me.

P4: Ya.

CH: So, what I will do is when I send the link for the second follow-up, just reply with the module you would like me to enroll in and have a look. Because that would actually be better than getting another lecturer's presence as well.

P4: Ya. Okay, perfect. So, I'll do that.

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

CH: Okay, so let's, let's get started with the questions then. Um, okay. So, I'm interested to know, like as an online lecturer, so forget the face-to-face lecturer because that's a, a place that you are far more comfortable with. But as an online lecturer, what do you believe is your primary responsibility?

P4: For me it's, it's, it's student engagement and, and trying to, to facilitate that whole passing the skills on in an online platform. Like that's, I mean, that's what we, that's still what we have to do. We're still trying to build skill-sets and, and, and engage the students in active learning. Whether or not we're in an online space or a face-to-face space, that's still the end goal.

CH: Hmm, okay. And how did you find that engagement? So, like how do you achieve that engagement with your students in an online space?

P4: So, I find it very difficult, um, personally because we, we can't really tell if, if the student is engaged via online; kind of just like do our thing and hope for the best. I find it very difficult to measure, um, if, if we are imparting skills and, and all the rest of it through that online space. I also find the responses to, to online inconsistent.

CH: Okay.

P4: So sometimes the students will be super engaged and other times they're just like mute and it is quite difficult to get that balance, to get them to be engaged all the time. Um, I I try and use class discussions a lot to try and ascertain and get feedback from the students. Like do they understand the content? Has the skill-set, you know, being improved or, or are we facilitating this exchange of skills? Like I think class discussions and on the [webinar], it's quite easy to just put them into break-out groups and then I always go in and check and whatever. And then usually at the end we do like a feedback session. So that's how I have been measuring at this point if, if, if it's working or not.

CH: Okay. And when, because you used I think a break-out group on the 24th when I observed...

P4: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>

CH: ...and I remember being put into a group.

P4: <laugh>.

CH: and there was silence, cricket silence, . But what was interesting, you did come in and you did say "What's going on here?" And, and what I was interested in, in seeing was they were working on the questions. It was quite interesting. So, there was silence. There wasn't engagement as a class discussion until you kind of prompted that discussion. And then the, the student, [Michelle], started the conversation. Um, and, and even though there was, they ordered it through the chat, eventually you could start seeing things come up on the chat. Um,

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

P4: You know, Chantal, at this point

CH: ...is that your typical experience that you have? Like what, what would be your typical experience when you use break-out rooms?

P4: It's, it's more the chats. I often go in and I do see that they do start engaging on the chats. I don't know, like for me it's so bizarre that law students don't want to speak. I'm just like, "Well guys, hello. I mean, do you know what you're going to be doing for a living? Like, hello? And also, this is a relatively safe environment for you to speak. It's not court." But on an online, online they always just use the chats. Always. It's, it's, it's a preferred and that's not even for the higher certificate, it's across the board. They always prefer the chat function rather than actually... I mean, you do get the odd students who will just unmute their mics and say whatever they need to say. But the majority of them always use chats if there is participation. Okay. You know what? I can't be too harsh on them. There generally is participation, but it happens more from the chat function than from the actual unmuting my mic and I'm going say what I say.

CH: Look, there could have been a situation where they saw that there was an unfamiliar, um, person in their group. Could have been that? That's why I asked what's the general...

P4: Not as though they would even have noticed <laugh>, no they, they, they always use the chat function. And I do try and go in and prompt them because also I have to pick and choose my battles. At least if they are doing the work, but they're using the chat function, okay, fine. At least they're doing it. So, I'm not going to, as long as it gets done, then I'm not going to be so like, okay. I mean I would obviously prefer, but if they're using the chat function, I also don't want to be too harsh on them for that. And then there's no engagement at all.

CH: Absolutely. And then you, you spoke about, um, it's still our, our responsibility to facilitate the skill-sets. Um, are there particular skill-sets that you are looking at, so if I look at in preparing students for the 21st century workplace, what skills do you consider important to develop with those students?

P4: Critical thinking, definitely critical thinking, problem-solving. They need that skill. So, at the higher certificate level it is imperative that we prepare them not only for LLB but to build that skill-set so that it can be developed in LLB. And then ultimately, we want to make good lawyers and you need critical thinking for that. It has to happen.

CH: And when you say critical thinking, break it down for me. What is critical thinking to you?

P4: So, for me it's the ability to grapple with concepts on your own and figure them out. So, so that problem solving is a huge one. And um, ya, what's the word that has just escaped me now. Application, there we go. Application. They have to be able to take the theory of it and apply it because I said to them, "Guys, when you have a client sitting in front of you, you're not going to have multiple choice. You're not going to have match the

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

columns. Those are great tools for revision, but you're going to be able to have to look at the law, look at the problem, and you're going to have to marry the two and apply. There's, it is application. So, for me, problem-solving, application, huge ones and then they have to, I mean, you know, even in, when you reading a case in, in, in the degree or whatever. I had a lecturer. I read a case property law, my worst. And every time I said to him, "You know what, Professor [Johnson], I don't understand." And he would say, "Read the case again. Read it, read it, read it again until you understand, figure it out." And it was a skill I had to learn to read something and get the essence of it. And so that's, that's what I mean by critical thinking. They have to grapple with these things on their own and figure it out and well, I mean we try to give them the tools to do that.

CH: Okay. So, so when you are saying read the case, um, getting the essence would be to extract the main idea...

P4: Correct.

CH: ...or the key components. So, extract the...

P4: Correct. And in law it's very easy because it's what the court decided. So, you need to extract the court's reasoning because that is what makes up the law.

CH: Okay. So, so the skill-sets are critical thinking and problem-solving. Are there any other skill-sets that you think are necessary in preparing them for the 21st century workplace?

P4: Resilience. I mean, it, it's not, it's not so much an academic quality, but it is an academic quality. Do you know what I mean? Um, just that personal like resilience, like dust yourself off, try again, dust yourself off, try again. Because that's what you need as just as in general as a life skill. And also, um, attention to detail because I've noticed a lot of them just hit that submission button. And very often what they hand in seems to be some sort of hostage situation and not an assignment. Like just words on the page held hostage there. Do you know what I mean? Like you've got to <laugh> it's true <laugh>. So please just, stop the hostage situation.

CH: I love the analogy <laugh>.

P4: So ya. Um, I try and, you know, say, "Just attention to detail, guys. Read your work before you submit it." I know that lots of them do it last minute.com and, but honestly, I mean I've had so many, "Ma'am, Ma'am I've submitted the wrong draft." And I'm thinking, but why, why are we in [this situation]? Because no one pays attention to detail.

CH: Okay. But when you say a hostage situation of words, I would take it you are also looking at academic writing there; the ability to communicate effectively on paper.

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

P4: Well, exactly. Yes. Not just a haphazard thing. Like does this answer have- is it structured? Does it make logical sense? Is there an argument here? Like what are you doing with your life? Ya.

CH: Okay. And, and so my question is why do you consider these important? Okay, so you explained to me from a, from a critical thinking problem-solving that that is in essence what you're going to be doing when you're within the law and you're sitting with a client, you can't refer back to your textbook. You're going to have to be able to connect. Okay. Resilience and this attention to detail. Why do you consider these important?

P4: Again, it's for practice. When you are going into practice, I mean, you know what, we don't want to prepare our students to fail. We want to prepare them to succeed. So, when you go into practice, you have to be meticulous, meticulous attention to detail. You can't have, you know, court documents looking like a dog's breakfast. You can't have, you can't hand in a hostage situation to the courts. Like you just can't do that. You have to pay attention. And you know what, especially like most of these, um, students think that they're going to be Harvey Specter in Suits. Like this is, you know, done deal for them. And I'm just saying to them, "But you, you guys have to pay attention to detail. You have to figure out the evidence. You have to strategize when you go into litigation. What are the strong points in your case? What are the weak points in your case? If you don't pay attention to detail, you're not going to be able to figure that out." I mean, usually you win a case on the nuance, not on the glaring evidence. So, they have to, they have to be alive to those facts.

CH: Okay. So, your skill-set is with the critical thinking and problem-solving is also quite analytical. So, they have to be quite analytical.

P4: Yes.

CH: And almost, um, with that nuanced thinking is almost like "thinking almost on their feet" to pinpoint. Because you're saying it's not, it's not the evidence, it's finding how you, it's the application of how you could get something that... Am I right? I'm not explaining it. Maybe you need to just clarify.

P4: Yes. No 100%. That's, it's exactly that. Because I mean, any, any attorney, if, if there's a glaring-like hole in your case, then any attorney will not take that case on and be like, "Listen, you don't have a winning case here." But those are the easy ones. It's, it's the harder cases where you have to pay attention to detail. And I mean, they don't know it yet because they're not there. But we, we, if we can build that skill-set now, then by the time they get there they would at least have a foundation. Because a lot of the stuff they're going to learn when they're in practice as well. We can't teach them everything. But when they get there, they would at least have that foundation of, "Okay, I can think like this." You know, it's so important to try and get them to think like lawyers. And that's what I try and do. Even from and, and I try and do that from a higher certificate, so that they have got lots of practice by the time they get there.

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

CH: Okay. So, it's a, it's definitely uh, almost like a thought processing skill that they have to work through.

P4: Yes. Correct.

CH: And whose responsibility do you believe it is to support or develop these skill-sets?

P4: It's ours as lecturers.

CH: Is it totally on us?

P4: No, it's not totally on us. Um, but we do have to, we do have to, you know, maintain that that throughout, um, that it's also on them. I mean, whether or not they do it or whether or not they, they take the opportunity to, to learn for themselves or whatever, that's ultimately on them. But it is, there is a, a large percentage that falls on us to be able to facilitate with all the presences, um, to facilitate that.

CH: Okay. So, if you had to give me a percentage, does it differ per year? Same?

P4: I think I would take a scaffolded approach to it. So, at a higher certificate and you can even see it like with the amount of support in slides. So, there's like a lot of information on my higher certificate slides, but not like, I mean there's a lot of pictures as well that I speak to. So, it's, it's a bit 50 50. But then as it goes through the years, there's less information on the slides and I just talk to it because I expect that my third year is taking notes as I'm speaking. I don't expect everything to be on the slide. They have to take responsibility. So, I use that kind of like scaffolded approach. So, like my first years and my higher certificates, you know, I might do extra revision slides and extra worksheets for them. Whereas my third years I'll say to them, "Right, this is a revision session, you tell me where the problems are and I will speak to that. I'm not going to give you masses of support." And then the second years are somewhere in between, you know. Because I think that it's important that they also realize that it is a scaffolded approach and that each year, each semester, they have to take on more accountability for their own engagement.

CH: Okay. So, when you say they need to take more accountability for their own engagement, would you then say that for you, the skill-set of like almost the independent, um, student is important. To be a researcher?

P4: Yes.

CH: To, to take the initiative? I'm not too sure what, where you would place your focus on? Is it to take the initiative, to find the information, so that they can then make an informed choice?

P4: Exactly. It's definitely to take the initiative. So, if I could give you an example: like at a first year, if I give them a [Learning Activity Completion] (LAC) to say, not that those worked terribly well, but just for example, purposes, if I give them a LAC and I say go and

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

read this case and summarize it. And then in class I'm like, "Okay guys, what did you guys take away from this? Then they will tell me, and I would have probably prepared a summary that I will then project on, on PowerPoint. And then say, "Okay guys, can you see now this is what you need to know. Please just check how far away you are." Whereas at a third-year level, I would have a discussion about that, and I would expect them, I wouldn't have anything projected. I would, from the discussion I would say, "You guys have missed this, this and this. Please go back and make sure you fill it in." So, you must take accountability for, for that kind of thing, have more initiative.

CH: Okay, cool. And then what is your understanding...

P4: Like I would...It's not like I would be like to leave them completely to their own devices. Like I would still guide them, but it would be more like less me, more you. Whereas at a first-year level, I would say, "Okay guys, please look how I did mine. This is what we expect from you. Learn to do it like this in the future."

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>. Okay. And what is your understanding of graduate attributes?

P4: It's the skill-set that they graduate with, I think. Like, can they critically think, can they problem solve? Can they do all of that? Are they independent workers? Because that's important.

CH: Okay. And I take it then you are going to prioritize some. So, do you prioritize some graduate attributes more than others? Or

P4: I think, you know, the ability to work independently because that's what you, that's what you expect from a graduate. I mean, in the working world, they are not going to be, you know, they'll be, I think they will be given the initial kind of like induction to a company, but after that it's like, here's your office, now work. Which we have all experienced and you sit there going "What on God's green earth am I doing?" But you figure it out and it's, it's, that is what I'm saying, like it is that resilience that, that you have to, you know, you figure it out. And that critical thinking, that initiative that will all come into play and determine ultimately whether you swim or sink.

CH: So almost to be, to be resourceful?

P4: Yes. They have to be resourceful. That's actually a very good word. Ya. To be resourceful.

CH: Okay. Um, then, okay, well I know why you prioritize these because you have spoken to how it leads to success within the, the legal fraternity. Um, so now if we look then at your online, um, session, your synchronous sessions, um, how do you support these graduate attributes that you've just referred to? I mean, you have looked at getting them to work independently, building that resilience, getting them to be able to think critically,

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

problem-solve, and try to be resourceful. So how do you support these graduate attributes in your creation of the online learning experiences for your students?

P4: So, what I try and do is I try and engage them in, in critical thinking and in also working independently. But as, as first years, um, I think they depend a lot on group work rather than on working independently. Um, they, I find that the result is better if I use the break-out groups rather than saying, "Okay guys, answer these questions on your own." Um, the, the quality of answer and also to, to keep that student engagement. I like group work, but I use lots of questions and answers. I think you would have noticed. So, like at the beginning I used the question and answers, the matching columns, to do a bit of a revision on the previous lecture. And then at the end of, of the second lecture, you would have seen that I gave them a whole bunch of questions on the entire learning unit so that I can say, "okay guys, here are these questions." And then from the answers, I can see now who has been engaged in critical thinking? How have they solved these problems? Have they, you know, depended too much on their peers? Or has there been individual-like work? And it's, I mean, it's easy also to, to tell, um, because you always get the shining lights coming to the top, you know, and then I can say, okay, this person has shied away from it, so I know that for next time you can note it and that kind of thing. And I, and I am hoping that the question and answer, and the, the group discussion that then follows, will try and promote that critical thinking and problem solving and attention to detail in the answers if they've left anything out and that kind of thing. Because it's also difficult in the online space, I find. Maybe I have to develop that skill myself. But it's difficult to, because you know, when you face-to-face you can always scan the class and see who doesn't understand. But online you can't do that. So, I have, I, I rely a lot on, on the, the technique of question-answers because then I can assess, okay, who understands the work? Who doesn't understand the work? Who is doing what?

CH: And do you find that, um, you try to, so when you are building questions into your, um, into your lesson, do you focus...do you try to build in higher-order thinking skills? Like the how's? Um, how is this achieved? Or do you find that you use a lot more lower-order thinking? Like the what's? Define? Explain?

P4: So... What, what I usually do is I use the lower-order one to, as in the PowerPoints. So, I will, so I find that if they know the answer, that's going to build confidence and it is going to encourage them to answer. And then after that I might say, "Geez, Chantal, that's like a good, you know, that's a good answer. Do you, do you want, let's just take this to the next level. Why do you think this happens? How do you think that happens?" And then have a bit more like discussion. Um, and then other people can also give their input, um, discussion around the higher-order thinking. But I also have found if you use too higher-order thinking, uh, questions, then everybody's just like, "Uh-uh <negative>, I don't know, I don't know." And then there's no engagement at all. So the lower ones as bait and then the higher ones as more of a discussion thing.

CH: I love your, your analogy, lower-order bait <laugh>. Hostage analogy; bait analogy <laugh>. So if we then go to the design, so let's look at the design of, of, of creating these



## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

online experiences. Would you then consider the questioning technique that you use as part of a design element?

P4: Yes, I think so. Um, because I also, like, I work very closely with the outcomes when I ask those questions because that, you know, I still have to make sure that they understand the learning outcomes or else in the exam or the POE they are going to flounder. So, I work closely with the design of, of the lecture is obviously centered around the outcomes, and then centered around the questioning and answering technique, and also centered around some form of group discussion. So, I always look out and see, okay, well what section can I use as a discussion? That's, that's how I structure it really.

CH: And then just with your questioning techniques, like the strategies that you use, do you ever put certain students on the spot? Do you prefer not to put students on the spot? Do you use probing questions? Like any strategies that you could share that you feel is part of your, your design strategy?

P4: So, I don't like putting students on the spot because with this particular class, when I've done that before, they're just flipping log out. And then they don't come back. And then I'm, then I'm just like, oh, great, now it's just chased that student away. I think that they're a little bit, which kills me because as a law student you need to have, you know, you need to be built of stronger stuff. But that's why I'm trying to like, "Okay guys, get resilient", you know. But a lot of them do, they just like put their, uh, thing logged out and then they'll send me a WhatsApp saying, "Sorry ma'am, I've got connectivity problems." Which I know that you don't, you've just logged out because I've asked you a question, you know. Um, sometimes I've said, "Okay, can so-and-so, can you just unmute your mic and just tell me something? And there's cricket silence. So obviously that person now has, has me on and is watching Netflix or something <laugh>, you know. And I'm just like, oh my gosh. Okay. And so, ya, so it doesn't, for this particular class, it's it's, they just log out.

CH: Okay.

P4: So, I don't do it because I would rather at least have them there than not there at all.

CH: Okay. So, so a key strategy for you is actually scaffolding your questions to build confidence?

P4: Yes. I'm trying that. I don't know if I am successful, but I'm trying that because I want to keep them there.

CH: Okay. Are there any other design elements that you think is important when you are designing your learning experiences for the students that you haven't spoken to? Because you have spoken to outcomes. So, outcomes is quite an important component to you to give direction. Your questions are aligned to your outcomes, um, and you've got that strategy of scaffolding and then you incorporate a discussional element. Is there anything else that you think is important from a design element that you would like to share?

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

P4: I'm trying to think. I don't, I don't think so. No, I think those are basically, that's, that's what I do. Um. Also, like I can't do, I can't do too much in a short period of time. Do you know what I mean? Also, if I'm doing too much in a short period of time and if I'm having too many elements, um, how am I going to measure the success of them? I, I would rather just keep it like questions, discussions, outcomes, then at least I know I'm focusing on those things, and I can measure if it's working or not. If I have like 50 things, then I, I, I don't know. I don't want to dilute the quality of what I'm doing at the moment. Does that make sense?

CH: That makes a hundred percent sense. So, when you are measuring it, it's measuring through the discussions? How do you measure?

P4: Yes. So, it, it, so I'm, I predominantly measure through the discussions, um, and and through the types of answers. So, I've noticed like you would have noticed [Michelle] is quite vocal.

CH: Mm-hmm <affirmative>.

P4: Well, at the beginning, at the beginning, she was a cricket. She wouldn't say anything. And I have noticed that she's now kind of coming into her own because even in class, like even if they say the most wrong answer, I've just been like, "Okay, let's take that and let's just work on it a little bit." So, trying to just, you know, build that confidence. And I have noticed like with her, it, it's worked quite well. With a couple of others, it's worked quite well as well, where they're now starting to explore the option of, "Okay, well let me say something in class." I mean I had [Michael]... [Michael], I, I have never heard his voice. He would just be mute the entire time. And the other day he gave me this long, beautiful answer in class and I just stopped, and I said, [Michael], congratulations, this is the first time I heard you speak. And then the whole class clapped and clapped and whatever. And I was like, and I said such an eloquent answer. I don't know why you're not answering more often because you obviously know what's going on, you know. So, I have noticed that that's, it's now starting to, well now that we are at the end, now it's starting to pay off and they are getting, you know, a little bit more confident. So, I think also it's nice to see that that approach is now paying off just by more participation, if that makes sense.

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>, I also think that confidence is an important element in your thinking when you are designing. That one of the things that you've worked on, um, is how do you support your students that they gain confidence in what they're doing?

P4: Ya, I'm trying <laugh>

CH: And maybe that's unintentional, that that might be an unintentional thing. That it may not be an intentional design element, but it's certainly something that you consider important.

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

P4: Yes. Especially for the higher certificate, because they are quite, uh, generally, quite an unconfident bunch. You know that they, "Oh, we didn't make it to LLB, we didn't make it to LLB." So that, you know, so I I, I'm, I'm glad that that's a consequence of it as well.

CH: Okay. And then, okay, so, so the techniques that you use to engage students in the online space, you've spoken about the synchronous, so you said you use the chat function. There are some students who will use the mic. You've mentioned that you use break-out groups so that they're in groups so that they build their confidence and they generally then participate in that break-out groups. And then you have the discussion, bring them all back together. Um, is there anything else in the online space that, in, in the synchronous space, that you do to encourage engagement? Or have I summed it up?

P4: Nope. You have summed it up.

CH: Okay. So now I'm going to take you to the asynchronous. So, let's go to asynchronous. Let's not go to your online lecture. Is there anything you do there in that asynchronous space to try and encourage engagement from your students?

P4: Just remind me what asynchronous is.

CH: Okay, so, so that would be on [the online platform] when they're not seeing you at the same time. So, um, you may give them activities like, uh, discussion that you might get them to, to discuss something. They might post on each other's answers. I don't, I don't know what your focus is in that space where you get them to navigate with the resources in [the online platform] in that particular module. And it's not real time. You're not seeing them for a lecture at that time. So, it might be LAC sessions. You might have built things in there.

P4: So, I did, um, some revision tutorials for my second years, um, which was a lovely... I thought like, again, just speaking to the scaffolding of the, of the different years. Um, so this particular class, <laugh>, they are BCom Law second years, they don't attend at all. I've had like maybe three or four people in the class at any given time, which has made life very difficult for me because I haven't been able to assess whether or not the class understands. Look, they've, they've performed relatively well in the assessments. So, I assume that there's a lot of self-study going on at home, um, because of the assessments. But I've been very concerned about, well, how, how am I going to help these students if, if I have got no bums in seats? So I created a online tutorial and I said, "Guys, these are extra tutorials." And what I essentially did was I just pulled questions from [the online platform] because they don't do the questions on [the online platform]. But they did them in this tutorial PowerPoint that I gave them. And I'm just like, "Well, it's the same thing guys." But anyway, just because it was packaged differently, they, they seemed to do it. And I got a few WhatsApps about a few questions, which was great. And then, um, what I did is to encourage self-directed learning. And this I did with [June] from [another campus in KZN] because her and I lectured this module this year, both of us for the first time because [Joshua] used to do it for both campuses and now he's upped and gone. So, headache becomes ours. So anyway, I said to her, it's, it's a bit of a, it is a bit of a difficult

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

module because it's risk and compliance, which is an arm of corporate governance, but they do corporate governance in third year, but they do risk and compliance here. So, it's a bit like putting the cart before the horse where we have to teach specifics, you know, like very specific principles and they haven't done the general principles yet. So there has been a, a little bit of a battle there. So, what [June] did is she said, you know, she wants to do a, a model answer for last year's test because just to give the kids some guidance. And I said, "No, let's not do that because then they're going to learn that model answer off by heart and regurgitate it no matter what the questions are. Why don't we do a scaffolded approach of question 1 can be found in the range of between pages 9 and 11 in your textbook. Question 1.2 can be found at page 43 to 44 on your textbook and let them build their own answers." So, we've given them guidance and then what happened was she did half the questions, and I did half the questions and then we swapped, we put them together and we put that model answer, if you will, on [the online platform]. So at least whoever was engaging in doing the past papers would have some guidance even though they weren't necessarily coming to class. So that's how I helped them with the asynchronous thing. Then for learning unit six, which was the last learning unit that we did, I had to go and find a whole bunch of articles because it wasn't covered in the textbook, learning unit six. And there were like a million prescribed articles. So, what I just did is I said, "Okay guys, I will help you out instead of you..." Because they had to research the, the articles, but then some, some students were finding articles from Namibian Journals and I was like, "no, but guys, that's obviously not relevant." <laugh>, "Please find them in the South African Journals". So there, there was a little bit of difficulty. So, what I did is I went, and I found the articles and I posted them up again. But I said to them, "I'm not going to tell you what they are about. You can read them and if you have a problem with your understanding, you're more than welcome to email me, phone me, contact me, whatever, and I will talk you through those principles. But you have to do that. I will help you and I will put them on [the online platform], but you have to do the rest." So, I think between the tutorials and between that model-answer scaffolding, that was how I tried to facilitate that space. And I mean, they could do that whenever.

CH: Okay. And how, how do you engage with them? Do you use announcements? Or do you use emails?

P4: Emails.

CH: Like how, how do you get them...?

P4: Emails.

CH: Emails on the [the online platform] system where you?...

P4: <Affirmative nod>.

CH: Okay...that email function?

P4: Yes.

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

CH: Okay.

P4: Just because they...

CH: And do they ever reply to you? Do they engage with you via, via email or do they just go directly onto [the online platform] and do the work?

P4: They engage with me with WhatsApp.

CH: WhatsApp.

P4: So even if I send them an email, they respond to me via WhatsApp. "I'm just like, great guys, thanks."

CH: <laugh>. Least they are responding.

P4: You know, half of them, the select few that do, they respond? Um, the, the, the most engaged student has been a student who at the beginning of the semester said, due to personal reasons, she lives in Maritzburg and she can't actually come to campus. But she had, she didn't miss an online lecture and she would actually send me weekly summaries. She would like, she would have her summaries of all her work that she was doing and, "Hi ma'am, is this right? Hi ma'am, is this right?" And I'm just like, "Ya, it's right, like this is your own summaries, take control of it." And she did the tutorials and she sent me like, "Ma'am, is this right?" And she would send me voice notes, "I'm doing this, I'm doing that." And she, she's done very well. Um, so there's, there is engagement from some of them, even if they don't sit in the class.

CH: Mm-hmm. <affirmative>. Okay.

P4: So that's what I try and do.

CH: And then let's move to now, um, the types of technologies that you are using. So obviously using your [webinar], um, are there particular, um... Or how do you select? So, I don't know if you, you like, if you use the discussion tool, the blog tool, the journal tool that's already on [the institution's online platform]? Or if you bring in Kahoot or Padlet? I am not too sure, you know, what you bring in. But how do you select the type of technologies when creating the online space, um, for your students in developing the 21st Century graduate attributes?

P4: Uh, I use the easiest <laugh>. That's, that's not, that's not the best answer, but it's the honest answer.

CH: I want honesty.

P4: <Laugh>. I use the easiest. Honestly. Because I cannot, I can't. I don't know how to use a Kahoot. I don't even know what a Padlet is. I just, I cannot, I cannot. So, I, the, the

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

biggest tool that I use is a Jamboard, I'm not even going to lie. And I just project the Jamboard.

CH: Some people don't know Jamboard. Some people don't know Jamboard.

P4: Chantal, can I just be honest with you, I didn't know Jamboard until you showcased it on your thing. Okay. So please, I am one of those people. And it was just such a great tool because everybody can get involved and it becomes fun and then they do the thing and it's fine. So, I use that. Um, and I use, I actually use social media. I know that sounds weird. Um, but my higher certificates, um, I was actually grappling with do I use the bedtime story, or do I use this? So, they had to do news clips for me....

CH: Okay.

P4: ...about whistle blowing. And a lot of them did use it. I, I said to them, I don't care if you use YouTube or TikTok or Facebook Live or Instagram Live or Twitter or whatever, I don't care. Just send me the link to your news clip about whistleblowing so I can see what you've done. And a lot of them used TikTok, a lot of them used, um, YouTube. So I have incorporated kind of like social media, which they think is fun. So, and they respond to it because, you know, they can all use TikTok, but nobody can find the blog on [the institution's online platform].

CH: <laugh>.

P4: Which is just like, I'm like, but if you can use TikTok, why can't you use it? So, I just said, "Okay, it's fine. I'm not going to, you know, pick and choose your battles." As long as they are engaging in technology, and it is working for me. So, they have... I don't know if that helps you.

CH: No, that, that absolutely helps. I mean, I'm looking for what works with you, and I think what's important that you have just said is whatever engages them. So, you almost open to the type of technology. So, the technology is not the focus, it is the platform that they are comfortable to use to respond to something. That, that's what I took from your response there.

P4: Yes. And that's 100%. Like if, if they're going to engage with it, then I am happy to use it as long as they are doing what they are supposed to do.

CH: And obviously the aim? So, you use the technology and the aim of the activity is for them to achieve whatever the outcome of the activity was?

P4: Correct.

CH: Okay. Okay. Um, which ones do you use most frequently? Just out of curiosity or, or it's really a, a mix?

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

P4: Look. Jamboard I would say is the most frequent because it's so easy. Like, it's just so easy. You can create it and quickly send the link in class. Like there's no kind of like, you know, huge big prior planning that has to go on because to be honest, with the amount of modules that we do, there is just no time for that. There's, there is no time for that. I have to do something that is quick, easy, and it, we are going to get the work done and move on, get the work done, and move on. Because we have also got a limited time to cover a whole bunch of content. So, I need stuff that is quick. It speaks to the outcome; it speaks to the skill-set. We can quickly evaluate whether it is working or not. And then, right, we are onto the next thing. So, the Jamboard works quite nicely. Um, the TikTok videos have worked quite nicely because firstly they are a wiz at TikTok videos. And secondly, I say to them, "Right, the first session, you guys are researching what whistleblowing is. The second session, you guys are creating your videos. And before everybody leaves, you will either WhatsApp it to me, airdrop it to me, email it to me, I don't care. But nobody leaves here until we have it." Because I also know that if I say, "Okay, you guys have until next week to do it", it never gets done anyway until the last minute. So I prefer also that little bit of pressure, "Ma'am said we can't leave until it's done." That little bit of pressure makes them work. And I'm actually quite surprised at the, at the, um, the quality. I mean, one, one group put a whole like SABC news, music at the front of their, at the front of their video with the logo of the news, so whatever. And I was, "While this is completely plagiarized! But okay," you know, "you have taken to this activity with such gusto that I am just going to let the plagiarism of the music slide." And, and the content was so good, and they had such fun with it. It was, maybe if we have to do the activity-thing again, I will use the Tiktok news clips as the next activity. But it was, it was great fun. And the quality was so good. I was shocked.

CH: Okay. So, do you think that um, by allowing them to choose their forum, their technology also um, encouraged a better quality of work from them?

P4: 100%

CH: Or do you think it was the design of the activity that led to this?

P4: Well, I think, you know what, a bit of both because it was something that they could be creative with and have fun with. And it was also something that they felt a little bit empowered with. Like we get to, to, to decide what, what medium we are using, so they feel a little bit less dictated to, and, and you know, they could actually, it was an opportunity for them to also take, and I said this to them, like, "You guys are going to take control of this activity as long as you have done A, B, and C in your videos. I don't care. Just give me something and please for the love of custard, do not, do not give me the same thing." So, I said, "Those are your outcomes, but don't present it in the same way because I have to watch 10 videos, I don't want to watch 10 of the same things." So, it also gave them like an opportunity to be creative and I think a lot of them felt empowered that they could take ownership of how this was going to be presented and really have fun with it. Which is not something that is, that you get to do often in law either. It doesn't lend itself. You know, law is very prescriptive. It either is or it isn't. So, the fact that they could do this I think was also quite exciting for them.

## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

CH: Okay. And then just the final question, um, for today are the challenges that perhaps you have experienced in the online learning experiences. What have been some of these challenges?

P4: You know, probably the wrong thing to say, but personally I just, I find it very difficult to connect with my students online. Especially like, okay, it is not so bad now because we see them, you know, in between the online, they are face-to-face. But you know, that 2020 when we were only online, I felt very disconnected to my students and I think that that is to a certain extent really hindered the delivery of, of my lectures because I didn't know their personalities. So, for example, I know like with my last year Higher Certificate class, I could be cheeky. I could, I could really be cheeky. I could, you know, give them a sarcastic comment and we would all laugh about it because they, they were kind of, you know, they were that way inclined. They were equally as cheeky. They made memes of me and sent it to me in class while I was teaching. And I would see it at the end of the lecture, and I would be like, "You guys have no shame. Like none whatsoever." And we would all laugh about it. This class, I can see they are a little bit more sensitive. So, I know not to perhaps make those jokes and I know that I can't tease them like I would tease the other class. I have to be a little bit more sensitive because they are a little bit more sensitive in their nature. But it is so hard, and I mean, you know, then obviously like when I am teaching and I can make a joke here and there, then I will because I know that it would be received well. But I, when you are only online, you can't pick up the vibe of the class. And so, then you kind of teaching in a very, I found, a very generic way where I couldn't bring my personality to it because I didn't know who my audience was essentially.

CH: Okay.

P4: Like I would never say to this class, "You guys have handed in a hostage situation." I could say that to last year's class because they would all laugh about it. But this year I would say, "You know what guys, the submissions need a little bit of work, hey." Because I would have to be gentler. But how, how do you know the difference when you don't know who is in your class? Because you can't tell online, you can't. So, teaching presence!

CH: <Laugh>. Okay, so, so the challenge was to be authentic. So that was...

P4: Exactly.

CH: ...your challenge because you are battling to read the class, to work out how to adapt your teaching strategy accordingly. Would that be an accurate summary?

P4: Exactly. That is an accurate, that is accurate. And also, just from when you are completely online, it is also very difficult to measure. Like I think I am getting better at it now by using questions and discussions. But in the beginning days of online, I will be honest with you, I did not know how to measure like if everybody is understanding. I would just kind of do the lecture and then go, "Please God, let everybody understand." Because I was just like, I don't know. You know, and I had to learn all those tools and I mean, at that stage I had just come back from maternity leave with my first child, so I was just trying



## Follow-up Meeting 1 with Participant 4

to learn [how to use the webinar tool]. Poor [EdTech Jane] was on the phone every other minute because I was like, "I don't know what I am doing!" So, you know, it was just finding your feet in that space as well that I I, which was, oh, it was a nightmare.

CH: Okay. So, so I take it that from the pandemic days, 2020 to our current situation, 2022, there has been substantial growth from the way you are speaking. So, if you had to give advice to someone who was going into the online space to help them be able to measure whether there was understanding and that, what advice would you give them? Because you have obviously gained some understanding and experience.

P4: So, the advice that I would give them is definitely to use questions and discussions as much as possible and to encourage engagement from the student, even if it is with the chat function. And also, to find a medium that works for your class. So is your class like, as hard as it is to ascertain the personalities from the class, like if you have noticed that they are using more text, then engage them in that more. Or if you notice, hey, you know what, this class is not afraid to unmute themselves, then yes, do the, do the discussions and, and whatever. Then you probably don't have to use the break-out groups as a security blanket. You could just have an open class discussion. But definitely to draw out using those question techniques and to build confidence in the online space, I would, I would say that. Because that is what has helped me. Ya.

CH: Okay. So, I am going to stop it there. I am going to stop our discussion today here. We will definitely pick up, um, with the challenges in our next discussion, um, and, and complete the other questions. But [Julie], thanks very much. I am going to end the recording now.

P4: You are welcome.